Guide to Industrial Control Systems (ICS) Security

Supervisory Control and Data Acquisition (SCADA) systems, Distributed Control Systems (DCS), and other control system configurations such as Programmable Logic Controllers (PLC)

Recommendations of the National Institute of Standards and Technology

Keith Stouffer
Joe Falco
Karen Scarfone
Guide to Industrial Control Systems (ICS) Security
Supervisory Control and Data Acquisition (SCADA) systems, Distributed Control Systems (DCS), and other control system configurations such as Programmable Logic Controllers (PLC)

Recommendations of the National Institute of Standards and Technology

C O M P U T E R   S E C U R I T Y

FINAL PUBLIC DRAFT

Computer Security Division
Information Technology Laboratory
National Institute of Standards and Technology
Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8930

Intelligent Systems Division
Manufacturing Engineering Laboratory
National Institute of Standards and Technology
Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8930

September 2008

U.S. Department of Commerce
Carlos M. Gutierrez, Secretary
National Institute of Standards and Technology
Dr. Patrick Gallagher, Acting Director
Reports on Computer Systems Technology

The Information Technology Laboratory (ITL) at the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) promotes the U.S. economy and public welfare by providing technical leadership for the nation’s measurement and standards infrastructure. ITL develops tests, test methods, reference data, proof of concept implementations, and technical analysis to advance the development and productive use of information technology. ITL’s responsibilities include the development of technical, physical, administrative, and management standards and guidelines for the cost-effective security and privacy of sensitive unclassified information in Federal computer systems. This Special Publication 800-series reports on ITL’s research, guidance, and outreach efforts in computer security and its collaborative activities with industry, government, and academic organizations.
Acknowledgments

The authors, Keith Stouffer, Joe Falco, and Karen Scarfone of the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST), wish to thank their colleagues who reviewed drafts of this document and contributed to its technical content. The authors would particularly like to acknowledge Tim Grance, Ron Ross, Stu Katzke, and Freemon Johnson of NIST for their keen and insightful assistance throughout the development of the document. The authors also gratefully acknowledge and appreciate the many contributions from the public and private sectors whose thoughtful and constructive comments improved the quality and usefulness of this publication. The authors would particularly like to thank the members of the Process Control Security Requirements Forum (PCSRF) and ISA99. The authors would also like to thank the UK National Centre for the Protection of National Infrastructure (CPNI) for allowing portions of the Good Practice Guide on Firewall Deployment for SCADA and Process Control Network to be used in this document as well as ISA for allowing portions of TR99.00.01: Security Technologies for Industrial Automation and Control System and TR99.00.02: Integrating Electronic Security into the Industrial Automation and Control Systems Environment to be used in this document.

Trademark Information

All product names are registered trademarks or trademarks of their respective organizations.
Table of Contents

Executive Summary .............................................................................................................. ES-1
1. Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1-1
   1.1 Authority ..................................................................................................................... 1-1
   1.2 Purpose and Scope ................................................................................................. 1-1
   1.3 Audience ..................................................................................................................... 1-1
   1.4 Document Structure ............................................................................................... 1-2
2. Overview of Industrial Control Systems ........................................................................ 2-1
   2.1 Overview of SCADA, DCS, and PLCs ..................................................................... 2-1
   2.2 ICS Operation .......................................................................................................... 2-2
   2.3 Key ICS Components ............................................................................................. 2-3
      2.3.1 Control Components ................................................................................. 2-3
      2.3.2 Network Components .................................................................................. 2-5
   2.4 SCADA Systems ....................................................................................................... 2-6
   2.5 Distributed Control Systems .................................................................................. 2-10
   2.6 Programmable Logic Controllers .......................................................................... 2-12
   2.7 Industrial Sectors and Their Interdependencies .................................................. 2-13
3. ICS Characteristics, Threats and Vulnerabilities ..................................................... 3-1
   3.1 Comparing ICS and IT Systems ............................................................................. 3-1
   3.2 Threats ...................................................................................................................... 3-5
   3.3 Potential ICS Vulnerabilities .................................................................................. 3-6
      3.3.1 Policy and Procedure Vulnerabilities ......................................................... 3-7
      3.3.2 Platform Vulnerabilities ............................................................................... 3-8
      3.3.3 Network Vulnerabilities .............................................................................. 3-12
   3.4 Risk Factors ............................................................................................................. 3-14
      3.4.1 Standardized Protocols and Technologies .................................................. 3-15
      3.4.2 Increased Connectivity ................................................................................. 3-15
      3.4.3 Insecure and Rogue Connections ............................................................... 3-16
      3.4.4 Public Information ....................................................................................... 3-16
   3.5 Possible Incident Scenarios .................................................................................... 3-17
   3.6 Sources of Incidents ............................................................................................... 3-18
   3.7 Documented Incidents ............................................................................................. 3-19
4. ICS Security Program Development and Deployment ............................................. 4-1
   4.1 Business Case for Security ..................................................................................... 4-1
      4.1.1 Benefits ............................................................................................................ 4-1
      4.1.2 Potential Consequences ................................................................................ 4-2
      4.1.3 Key Components of the Business Case ....................................................... 4-3
      4.1.4 Resources for Building Business Case ...................................................... 4-4
      4.1.5 Presenting the Business Case to Leadership ............................................. 4-4
   4.2 Developing a Comprehensive Security Program ..................................................... 4-5
      4.2.1 Senior Management Buy-in .......................................................................... 4-5
      4.2.2 Build and Train a Cross-Functional Team ................................................... 4-5
      4.2.3 Define Charter and Scope ............................................................................ 4-6
      4.2.4 Define ICS Specific Security Policies and Procedures ......................... 4-6
      4.2.5 Define and Inventory ICS Systems and Networks Assets .................... 4-6
4.2.6 Perform Risk and Vulnerability Assessment .............................................. 4-7
4.2.7 Define the Mitigation Controls ................................................................. 4-8
4.2.8 Provide Training and Raise Security Awareness .................................... 4-9

5. Network Architecture .................................................................................. 5-1
5.1 Firewalls ........................................................................................................ 5-1
5.2 Logically Separated Control Network ......................................................... 5-3
5.3 Network Segregation .................................................................................... 5-3
  5.3.1 Dual-Homed Computer/Dual Network Interface Cards (NIC) .............. 5-3
  5.3.2 Firewall between Corporate Network and Control Network .............. 5-4
  5.3.3 Firewall and Router between Corporate Network and Control Network  5-6
  5.3.4 Firewall with DMZ between Corporate Network and Control Network  5-7
  5.3.5 Paired Firewalls between Corporate Network and Control Network ...... 5-9
  5.3.6 Network Segregation Summary .............................................................. 5-10
5.4 Recommended Defense-in-Depth Architecture ............................................ 5-10
5.5 General Firewall Policies for ICS ................................................................. 5-11
5.6 Recommended Firewall Rules for Specific Services ...................................... 5-13
  5.6.1 Domain Name System (DNS) ................................................................. 5-14
  5.6.2 Hypertext Transfer Protocol (HTTP) .................................................... 5-14
  5.6.3 FTP and Trivial File Transfer Protocol (TFTP) ...................................... 5-14
  5.6.4 Telnet ..................................................................................................... 5-14
  5.6.5 Simple Mail Transfer Protocol (SMTP) ............................................... 5-14
  5.6.6 Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP) ................................. 5-15
  5.6.7 Distributed Component Object Model (DCOM) .................................. 5-15
  5.6.8 SCADA and Industrial Protocols ......................................................... 5-15
5.7 Network Address Translation (NAT) .......................................................... 5-15
5.8 Specific ICS Firewall Issues .......................................................................... 5-16
  5.8.1 Data Historians ..................................................................................... 5-16
  5.8.2 Remote Support Access ....................................................................... 5-16
  5.8.3 Multicast Traffic ................................................................................... 5-17
5.9 Single Points of Failure ................................................................................ 5-17
5.10 Redundancy and Fault Tolerance ................................................................. 5-18
5.11 Preventing Man-in-the-Middle Attacks ....................................................... 5-18

6. ICS Security Controls ...................................................................................... 6-1
6.1 Management Controls ................................................................................ 6-1
  6.1.1 Risk Assessment .................................................................................. 6-2
  6.1.2 Planning ............................................................................................... 6-3
  6.1.3 System and Services Acquisition ......................................................... 6-4
  6.1.4 Certification, Accreditation, and Security Assessments ...................... 6-5
6.2 Operational Controls .................................................................................... 6-6
  6.2.1 Personnel Security ............................................................................... 6-7
  6.2.2 Physical and Environmental Protection .............................................. 6-7
  6.2.3 Contingency Planning ......................................................................... 6-11
  6.2.4 Configuration Management ............................................................... 6-13
  6.2.5 Maintenance ....................................................................................... 6-14
  6.2.6 System and Information Integrity ....................................................... 6-14
  6.2.7 Media Protection .................................................................................. 6-18
  6.2.8 Incident Response ............................................................................... 6-18
  6.2.9 Awareness and Training ..................................................................... 6-21
6.3 Technical Controls ....................................................................................... 6-22
### List of Appendices

- Appendix A—Acronyms and Abbreviations ............................................................ A-1
- Appendix B—Glossary of Terms .......................................................................... B-1
- Appendix C—Current Activities in Industrial Control System Security .............. C-1
- Appendix D—Emerging Security Capabilities .................................................... D-1
- Appendix E—Industrial Control Systems in the FISMA Paradigm ..................... E-1
- Appendix F—References ....................................................................................... F-9

### List of Figures

- Figure 2-1. ICS Operation ..................................................................................... 2-3
- Figure 2-2. SCADA System General Layout ...................................................... 2-7
- Figure 2-3. Basic SCADA Communication Topologies ....................................... 2-8
- Figure 2-4. Large SCADA Communication Topology ......................................... 2-8
- Figure 2-5. SCADA System Implementation Example (Distribution Monitoring and Control) ... 2-9
- Figure 2-6. SCADA System Implementation Example (Rail Monitoring and Control) ... 2-10
- Figure 2-7. DCS Implementation Example .......................................................... 2-11
- Figure 2-8. PLC Control System Implementation Example .................................. 2-12
- Figure 3-1. Industrial Security Incidents by Year ............................................... 3-19
- Figure 5-1. Firewall between Corporate Network and Control Network .......... 5-4
- Figure 5-2. Firewall and Router between Corporate Network and Control Network ... 5-6
- Figure 5-3. Firewall with DMZ between Corporate Network and Control Network .... 5-7
- Figure 5-4. Paired Firewalls between Corporate Network and Control Network .... 5-9
- Figure 5-5. CSSP Recommended Defense-In-Depth Architecture ...................... 5-11
- Figure E-1. Risk Framework ................................................................................. E-3
List of Tables

Table 3-1. Summary of IT System and ICS Differences ........................................................... 3-3
Table 3-2. Adversarial Threats to ICS ....................................................................................... 3-5
Table 3-3. Policy and Procedure Vulnerabilities ....................................................................... 3-7
Table 3-4. Platform Configuration Vulnerabilities ..................................................................... 3-8
Table 3-5. Platform Hardware Vulnerabilities ........................................................................... 3-10
Table 3-6. Platform Software Vulnerabilities ........................................................................... 3-10
Table 3-7. Platform Malware Protection Vulnerabilities .......................................................... 3-11
Table 3-8. Network Configuration Vulnerabilities ..................................................................... 3-12
Table 3-9. Network Hardware Vulnerabilities ......................................................................... 3-13
Table 3-10. Network Perimeter Vulnerabilities ........................................................................ 3-13
Table 3-11. Network Monitoring and Logging Vulnerabilities .................................................. 3-14
Table 3-12. Communication Vulnerabilities ............................................................................ 3-14
Table 3-13. Wireless Connection Vulnerabilities ...................................................................... 3-14
Table 4-1. Suggested Actions for ICS Vulnerability Assessments ........................................... 4-8
Table E-1. Possible Definitions for ICS Impact Levels Based on ISA-TR99.00.02 .................. E-5
Table E-2. Possible Definitions for ICS Impact Levels Based on Product Produced, Industry  
and Security Concerns ........................................................................................................... E-5
Executive Summary

This document provides guidance for establishing secure industrial control systems (ICS). These ICS, which include supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) systems, distributed control systems (DCS), and other control system configurations such as skid-mounted Programmable Logic Controllers (PLC) are often found in the industrial control sectors. ICS are typically used in industries such as electric, water and wastewater, oil and natural gas, transportation, chemical, pharmaceutical, pulp and paper, food and beverage, and discrete manufacturing (e.g., automotive, aerospace, and durable goods.) SCADA systems are generally used to control dispersed assets using centralized data acquisition and supervisory control. DCS are generally used to control production systems within a local area such as a factory using supervisory and regulatory control. PLCs are generally used for discrete control for specific applications and generally provide regulatory control. These control systems are vital to the operation of the U.S. critical infrastructures that are often highly interconnected and mutually dependent systems. It is important to note that approximately 90 percent of the nation's critical infrastructures are privately owned and operated. Federal agencies also operate many of the ICS mentioned above; other examples include air traffic control and materials handling (e.g., Postal Service mail handling.) This document provides an overview of these ICS and typical system topologies, identifies typical threats and vulnerabilities to these systems, and provides recommended security countermeasures to mitigate the associated risks.

Initially, ICS had little resemblance to traditional information technology (IT) systems in that ICS were isolated systems running proprietary control protocols using specialized hardware and software. Widely available, low-cost Internet Protocol (IP) devices are now replacing proprietary solutions, which increases the possibility of cyber security vulnerabilities and incidents. As ICS are adopting IT solutions to promote corporate business systems connectivity and remote access capabilities, and are being designed and implemented using industry standard computers, operating systems (OS) and network protocols, they are starting to resemble IT systems. This integration supports new IT capabilities, but it provides significantly less isolation for ICS from the outside world than predecessor systems, creating a greater need to secure these systems. While security solutions have been designed to deal with these security issues in typical IT systems, special precautions must be taken when introducing these same solutions to ICS environments. In some cases, new security solutions are needed that are tailored to the ICS environment.

Although some characteristics are similar, ICS also have characteristics that differ from traditional information processing systems. Many of these differences stem from the fact that logic executing in ICS has a direct affect on the physical world. Some of these characteristics include significant risk to the health and safety of human lives and serious damage to the environment, as well as serious financial issues such as production losses, negative impact to a nation’s economy, and compromise of proprietary information. ICS have unique performance and reliability requirements and often use operating systems and applications that may be considered unconventional to typical IT personnel. Furthermore, the goals of safety and efficiency sometimes conflict with security in the design and operation of control systems.

Originally, ICS implementations were susceptible primarily to local threats because many of their components were in physically secured areas and the components were not connected to IT networks or systems. However, the trend toward integrating ICS systems with IT networks provides significantly less isolation for ICS from the outside world than predecessor systems, creating a greater need to secure these systems from remote, external threats. Also, the increasing use of wireless networking places ICS implementations at greater risk from adversaries who are in relatively close physical proximity but do not have direct physical access to the equipment. Threats to control systems can come from numerous sources, including hostile governments, terrorist groups, disgruntled employees, malicious intruders, complexities, accidents, natural disasters as well as malicious or accidental actions by insiders. ICS security objectives typically follow the priority of availability, integrity and confidentiality, in that order.
Possible incidents an ICS may face include the following:

- Blocked or delayed flow of information through ICS networks, which could disrupt ICS operation
- Unauthorized changes to instructions, commands, or alarm thresholds, which could damage, disable, or shut down equipment, create environmental impacts, and/or endanger human life
- Inaccurate information sent to system operators, either to disguise unauthorized changes, or to cause the operators to initiate inappropriate actions, which could have various negative effects
- ICS software or configuration settings modified, or ICS software infected with malware, which could have various negative effects
- Interference with the operation of safety systems, which could endanger human life.

Major security objectives for an ICS implementation should include the following:

- **Restricting logical access to the ICS network and network activity.** This includes using a demilitarized zone (DMZ) network architecture with firewalls to prevent network traffic from passing directly between the corporate and ICS networks, and having separate authentication mechanisms and credentials for users of the corporate and ICS networks. The ICS should also use a network topology that has multiple layers, with the most critical communications occurring in the most secure and reliable layer.

- **Restricting physical access to the ICS network and devices.** Unauthorized physical access to components could cause serious disruption of the ICS’s functionality. A combination of physical access controls should be used, such as locks, card readers, and/or guards.

- **Protecting individual ICS components from exploitation.** This includes deploying security patches in as expeditious a manner as possible, after testing them under field conditions; disabling all unused ports and services; restricting ICS user privileges to only those that are required for each person’s role; tracking and monitoring audit trails; and using security controls such as antivirus software and file integrity checking software where technically feasible to prevent, deter, detect, and mitigate malware.

- **Maintaining functionality during adverse conditions.** This involves designing the ICS so that each critical component has a redundant counterpart. Additionally, if a component fails, it should fail in a manner that does not generate unnecessary traffic on the ICS or other networks, or does not cause another problem elsewhere, such as a cascading event.

- **Restoring system after an incident.** Incidents are inevitable and an incident response plan is essential. A major characteristic of a good security program is how quickly a system can be recovered after an incident has occurred.

To properly address security in an ICS, it is essential for a cross-functional cyber security team to share their varied domain knowledge and experience to evaluate and mitigate risk to the ICS. The cyber security team should consist of a member of the organization’s IT staff, control engineer, control system operator, network and system security expert, a member of the management staff, and a member of the physical security department at a minimum. For continuity and completeness, the cyber security team should consult with the control system vendor and/or system integrator as well. The cyber security team should report directly to site management (e.g., facility superintendent) or the company’s CIO/CSO, who in turn, accepts complete responsibility and accountability for the cyber security of the ICS. An effective cyber security program for an ICS should apply a strategy known as “defense-in-depth”, layering security mechanisms such that the impact of a failure in any one mechanism is minimized.
In a typical ICS this means a defense-in-depth strategy that includes:

- Developing security policies, procedures, training and educational material that apply specifically to the ICS.
- Considering ICS security policies and procedures based on the Homeland Security Advisory System Threat Level, deploying increasingly heightened security postures as the Threat Level increases.
- Addressing security throughout the lifecycle of the ICS from architecture design to procurement to installation to maintenance to decommissioning.
- Implementing a network topology for the ICS that has multiple layers, with the most critical communications occurring in the most secure and reliable layer.
- Providing logical separation between the corporate and ICS networks (e.g., stateful inspection firewall(s) between the networks).
- Employing a DMZ network architecture (i.e., prevent direct traffic between the corporate and ICS networks).
- Ensuring that critical components are redundant and are on redundant networks.
- Designing critical systems for graceful degradation (fault tolerant) to prevent catastrophic cascading events.
- Disabling unused ports and services on ICS devices after testing to assure this will not impact ICS operation.
- Restricting physical access to the ICS network and devices.
- Restricting ICS user privileges to only those that are required to perform each person’s job (i.e., establishing role-based access control and configuring each role based on the principle of least privilege).
- Considering the use of separate authentication mechanisms and credentials for users of the ICS network and the corporate network (i.e., ICS network accounts do not use corporate network user accounts).
- Using modern technology, such as smart cards for Personal Identity Verification (PIV).
- Implementing security controls such as intrusion detection software, antivirus software and file integrity checking software, where technically feasible, to prevent, deter, detect, and mitigate the introduction, exposure, and propagation of malicious software to, within, and from the ICS.
- Applying security techniques such as encryption and/or cryptographic hashes to ICS data storage and communications where determined appropriate.
- Expeditiously deploying security patches after testing all patches under field conditions on a test system if possible, before installation on the ICS.
- Tracking and monitoring audit trails on critical areas of the ICS.
NIST has created the Industrial Control System Security project\(^1\) in cooperation with the public and private sector ICS community to develop specific guidance on the application of the security controls in NIST SP 800-53, *Recommended Security Controls for Federal Information Systems* to ICS.

While most controls in Appendix F of NIST SP 800-53 are applicable to ICS as written, several controls did require ICS-specific interpretation and/or augmentation by adding one or more of the following to the control:

- **ICS Supplemental Guidance** that provides additional guidance on how the control applies, or does not apply, in ICS environments
- **ICS Enhancements** (one or more) that provide enhancement augmentations to the original control that may be required for some ICS
- **ICS Enhancement Supplemental Guidance** that provides guidance on how the control enhancement applies, or does not apply, in ICS environments.

This ICS-specific guidance is included in NIST SP 800-53, Revision 2, Appendix I: Industrial Control Systems – Security Controls, Enhancements, and Supplemental Guidance. Section 6 of this document also provides initial guidance on how 800-53 security controls apply to ICS. Initial recommendations and guidance, if available, are provided in an outlined box for each section.

Additionally, Appendix C of this document provides an overview of the many activities currently ongoing among Federal organizations, standards organizations, industry groups, and automation system vendors to make available recommended practices in the area of ICS security.

---

\(^1\) The Industrial Control System Security Project Web site is located at: [http://csrc.nist.gov/groups/SMA/fisma/ics/](http://csrc.nist.gov/groups/SMA/fisma/ics/)
1. Introduction

1.1 Authority


NIST is responsible for developing standards and guidelines, including minimum requirements, for providing adequate information security for all agency operations and assets, but such standards and guidelines shall not apply to national security systems. This guideline is consistent with the requirements of the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) Circular A-130, Section 8b(3), “Securing Agency Information Systems,” as analyzed in A-130, Appendix IV: Analysis of Key Sections. Supplemental information is provided in A-130, Appendix III.

This guideline has been prepared for use by Federal agencies. It may be used by nongovernmental organizations on a voluntary basis and is not subject to copyright, though attribution is desired.

Nothing in this document should be taken to contradict standards and guidelines made mandatory and binding on Federal agencies by the Secretary of Commerce under statutory authority, nor should these guidelines be interpreted as altering or superseding the existing authorities of the Secretary of Commerce, Director of the OMB, or any other Federal official.

1.2 Purpose and Scope

The purpose of this document is to provide guidance for securing industrial control systems (ICS), including supervisory control and data acquisition (SCADA) systems, distributed control systems (DCS), and other systems performing control functions. The document provides an overview of ICS and typical system topologies, identifies typical threats and vulnerabilities to these systems, and provides recommended security countermeasures to mitigate the associated risks. Because there are many different types of ICS with varying levels of potential risk and impact, the document provides a list of many different methods and techniques for securing ICS. The document should not be used purely as a checklist to secure a specific system. Readers are encouraged to perform a risk-based assessment on their systems and to tailor the recommended guidelines and solutions to meet their specific security, business and operational requirements.

The scope of this document includes ICS that are typically used in the electric, water and wastewater, oil and natural gas, chemical, pharmaceutical, pulp and paper, food and beverage, and discrete manufacturing (automotive, aerospace, and durable goods) industries.

1.3 Audience

This document covers details specific to ICS. The document is technical in nature; however, it provides the necessary background to understand the topics that are discussed.

The intended audience is varied and includes the following:

- Control engineers, integrators, and architects who design or implement secure ICS
- System administrators, engineers, and other information technology (IT) professionals who administer, patch, or secure ICS